# **EMBRACE THE STINK BOMB**

Jeff Weniger — Head of Equity Strategy 06/16/2017

Not many money management firms spend time talking about maligned asset classes, and most clients don't ask about them. To lose half of my readers right now, let me make a bull case for commodities. This one should be lonely.

We have a real stinker, a shunned exchange-traded fund (ETF), even though it shows up at the top of its category since its launch almost 10 years ago. The <u>WisdomTree Continuous Commodity Index Fund (GCC)</u> has lost an annualized 5.1% since its inception on January 25, 2008, or 38.7% cumulatively. Even that showing was enough to put it at the top of the heap among the five diversified commodity ETFs that have been around that long. Yet a relative performance like that can leave much to be desired.

Get ready for WisdomTree's "Stinker Study."

## Contrarians: Grab the Stink Bomb

Using indexes representing U.S. large caps, U.S. mid-caps, U.S. small caps, international developed stocks, U.S. high-yield bonds, U.S. core bonds and commodities, <sup>1</sup> we assessed various asset class rotation strategies based on trailing five-year returns.

Each year, the investor could look back at the performance of the preceding five years and go "all in" on the index that had the best run, the second-best run and so on.

The truly independent-minded would look at the bottom of the list and allocate to the Stinker—the one that had the worst last five years of the lot. At the end of the year, the process is repeated. Figure 1 shows the results for January 31, 1997, through March 31, 2017.

Figure 1: Asset Class "Stinker" Study



		Return (%)	Std Dev (%)	Downside Risk (%)	Beta vs. Market*	Sharpe Ratio	Information Ratio vs. Market*	Tracking Error vs. Market (%)*		Maximum Drawdown
	U.S. Large Caps	7.90%	15.21%	11.53%	1.00	0.38	0.00	0.00%	1.00	-50.95%
	U.S. Mid-Caps	10.12%	16.97%	12.91%	1.04	0.47	0.35	6.31%	0.93	-54.15%
ses	U.S. Small Caps	8.27%	19.95%	14.92%	1.07	0.31	0.03	11.53%	0.82	-52.89%
class	International Developed ex-U.S.									
Asset	Equities	4.90%	16.84%	12.76%	0.93	0.16	-0.33	9.18%	0.84	-56.40%
Ass	U.S. High-Yield Bonds	7.03%	9.03%	6.95%	0.37	0.54	-0.07	11.88%	0.63	-33.22%
	U.S. Aggregate Bonds	5.26%	3.43%	2.51%	-0.01	0.90	-0.17	15.74%	-0.04	-3.83%
	Commodities	0.38%	16.27%	11.91%	0.33	-0.11	-0.41	18.48%	0.31	-67.03%
	Best Performer in PrevioU.S. 5 Yrs.	4.49%	13.49%	10.53%	0.73	0.17	-0.39	8.69%	0.82	-49.21%
	2nd Best Performer in PrevioU.S. 5 Yrs.	6.46%	15.70%	11.84%	0.80	0.27	-0.14	10.46%	0.77	-44.80%
S	3rd Best Performer in PrevioU.S. 5 Yrs.	6.61%	17.93%	13.69%	0.88	0.25	-0.11	12.14%	0.74	-49.64%
egie	4th Best Performer in PrevioU.S. 5 Yrs.	6.40%	14.48%	10.75%	0.61	0.29	-0.12	12.52%	0.65	-51.39%
Strategies	5th Best Performer in PrevioU.S. 5 Yrs.	6.59%	13.46%	9.90%	0.62	0.33	-0.12	11.21%	0.70	-39.22%
	6th Best Performer in PrevioU.S. 5 Yrs.	4.36%	14.60%	10.65%	0.64	0.15	-0.29	12.19%	0.67	-45.31%
	Worst Performer in PrevioU.S. 5 Yrs.	9.02%	11.96%	8.49%	0.43	0.57	0.08	13.29%	0.54	-36.27%
	EqualWeight, All Strategies	6.74%	11.17%	8.61%	0.67	0.41	-0.17	6.73%	0.91	-39.71%

Sources: Zephyr StyleADVISOR, WisdomTree, data from 01/31/1997 - 03/31/2017. \*Beta, Information Ratio, Tracking error and Correlation are calculated relative to the S&P 500. Strategies are based on annual rebalancing based on performance from previous 5 years. For example, for calendar 1998, an investor in the "Best Performer in Previous 5 Years" would own the asset class with the highest return from 12/31/1992-12/31/1997. Past performance is not indicative of future results. You cannot invest directly in an index.

# **Loved Darlings vs. Stinkers**

Woeful performance by the top performing "Loved Darling" is particularly notable. The investor who chased the darling of the previous five years every year witnessed subsequent annual returns of just 4.49%, more than 2 percentage points south of a strategy that simply put an equal allocation in all seven asset classes.

Contrast that with the experience of the investor who had the courage to buy the Stinker: returns came in at 9.02% annually for more than 20 years. That came with an annualized <u>standard deviation</u> of just 11.96%, lower than all of the equity indexes because aggregate bonds came up four times (at the end of 1996, 1997, 2006 and 2007). That also got some contrarians into bonds on December 31, 2007, a fortuitous move when Lehman collapsed in 2008.

The Stinker Strategy managed to have the lowest drawdown and downside risk with the highest <u>Sharpe ratio</u> and highest information ratio of any of the rotation strategies.

### **But the Stink Got Stinkier**

The Stinker Strategy posted annual gains for 16 of 17 calendar years to the end of 2013, but unfortunately it picked up commodities for both 2014 and 2015—and those were woeful years for the asset class.<sup>2</sup>

In retrospect, we know that the Stinker Strategy made a series of great calls —for example, showing net gains during the 2000–2002 comeuppance in equity markets. The strategy also posted a 5.2% return during the year of Lehman's collapse because it liked bonds, while it transitioned to U.S. stocks for 2009, benefiting from the sharp rally (figure 2).

Figure 2: The Stinker Strategy through the Years

	YTD	2016	2015	2014	2013	2012	2011	2010	2009	2008	2007
Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	5.2%	12.0%	-2.4%	13.2%	7.4%	15.6%	4.4%	15.2%	5.9%	-43.1%	11.6%
2nd Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	6.1%	13.8%	-4.4%	4.9%	-2.0%	4.2%	7.8%	23.7%	16.8%	-41.5%	17.2%
3rd Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	2.5%	21.3%	1.4%	2.5%	34.8%	-5.0%	-10.5%	6.5%	32.5%	-33.8%	5.6%
4th Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	2.7%	17.5%	-4.6%	13.7%	38.8%	17.3%	-1.6%	8.2%	40.5%	-28.6%	-1.6%
5th Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	7.4%	1.5%	-0.4%	-4.5%	32.4%	16.4%	-4.2%	25.5%	57.5%	-37.0%	2.2%
6th Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	0.8%	2.7%	0.6%	6.0%	-10.1%	16.0%	-11.7%	26.9%	27.2%	-26.4%	5.5%
Worst Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	-0.3%	5.6%	-17.8%	-10.3%	23.3%	17.9%	2.1%	15.1%	26.5%	5.2%	7.0%



	2006	2005	2004	2003	2002	2001	2000	1999	1998	1997
Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	15.3%	2.4%	12.5%	4.1%	-16.2%	-11.9%	-9.1%	21.0%	28.6%	29.0%
2nd Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	11.8%	12.7%	20.2%	40.1%	-22.1%	-5.6%	8.3%	18.2%	10.1%	22.4%
3rd Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	9.2%	21.4%	18.3%	28.2%	-20.5%	2.5%	-3.0%	21.3%	-2.6%	33.4%
4th Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	18.4%	2.7%	4.3%	11.3%	10.3%	-21.2%	-14.0%	27.3%	3.0%	13.3%
5th Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	4.3%	4.6%	10.9%	28.7%	-1.9%	8.4%	-5.1%	2.4%	20.3%	-3.4%
6th Best Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	26.9%	14.0%	20.7%	47.3%	-15.7%	4.5%	11.6%	-0.8%	-27.0%	2.1%
Worst Performer in Previous 5 Yrs.	15.8%	4.9%	10.9%	39.2%	18.4%	-17.2%	14.4%	21.3%	8.7%	9.7%

Sources: WisdomTree, Zephyr StyleADVISOR.

Now it gets philosophical. Either the Stinker Strategy itself is a stinker because it has given false hope to commodities in recent years or recent years of struggle have been an aberration, sure to come sooner or later in any two-decade run. Either way, the Stinker Strategy identified commodities as a contrarian play at the end of 2013, and the asset class just kept grinding lower. If the asset class was hated then, it may be hated more now.

#### GCC: If Ever There Was a Stinker

The WisdomTree Continuous Commodities Index ETF (GCC) has a simple strategy: it takes 17 commodities, everything from corn to platinum to lean hogs, and invests equally in each of them. There is no major exposure to any particular commodity, no riding oil from triple digits down to \$28 per barrel, at least not to the extent that oil represents anything more than 1/17th of the portfolio.

Aside from a brief bounce higher in the 2009–2010 recovery, commodities haven't had much love since the go-go years of the so-called "commodities supercycle," which ended a half generation ago. No surprise then that, as of March 31, 2017, the "order of finish," from Loved Darling to Stinker, was U.S. Large Caps, U.S. Mid-Caps, U.S. Small Caps, U.S. High Yield, International Developed Stocks, Aggregate Bonds and Commodities.

Few clients ask about GCC, and that's because it's a total stinker.

It's a true contrarian's dream.

Unless otherwise noted, data sources are WisdomTree, Zephyr StyleADVISOR and Bloomberg, as of March 31, 2017.

<sup>1</sup>S&P 500, Russell Midcap, Russell 2000, MSCI EAFE, BofA Merrill Lynch US High Yield, Bloomberg Barclays U.S. Aggrega to indexes for the first six asset classes. Commodities are represented by the Bloomberg Commodity index through 8/31/99 and the Thomson Reuters Equal Weight Commodity Index thereafter.

<sup>2</sup>Sources: Zephyr StyleADVISOR, WisdomTree. <u>Thomson Reuters Equal Weight Commodity Index</u>, 2014 = -10.31%, 2015 = -17.76%.

#### Important Risks Related to this Article

There are risks associated with investing including possible loss of principal. An investment in this Fund is speculative, involves a substantial degree of risk, and should not constitute an investor's entire portfolio. One of the risks associated with the Fund is the complexity of the different factors which contribute to the Fund's performance. These factors include use of commodity futures contracts. Derivatives can be volatile and may be less liquid than other securities and more sensitive to the effects of varied economic conditions. The value of the shares of the Fund relate directly to the value of the futures contracts and other assets held by the Fund and any fluctuation in the value of these assets could adversely affect an investment in the Fund's shares. The Fund is not an Investment Company within the meaning of the Investment Company Act of 1940, as amended, and is not subject to the regulations thereunder. Please read the Fund's prospectus



for specific details regarding the Fund's risk profile.

Investments in commodities may be affected by overall market movements, changes in interest rates and other factors such as weather, disease, embargoes and international economic and political developments.

Commodities and futures are generally volatile and are not suitable for all investors.

Performance is historical and does not guarantee future results. Current performance may be lower or higher than quoted. Investment returns and principal value of an investment will fluctuate so that an investor's shares, when redeemed, may be worth more or less than their original cost. Performance data for the most recent month-end is available at <a href="https://www.wisdomtree.com">www.wisdomtree.com</a>.

WisdomTree shares are bought and sold at market price (not NAV) and are not individually redeemed from the Fund. Total returns are calculated using the daily 4:00 p.m. EST net asset value (NAV). Market price returns reflect the midpoint of the bid/ask spread as of the close of trading on the exchange where Fund shares are listed. Market price returns do not represent the returns you would receive if you traded shares at other times.

For standardized performance and the most recent month-end performance click <u>here</u> NOTE, this material is intended for electronic use only. Individuals who intend to print and physically deliver to an investor must print the monthly performance report to accompany this blog.

For more investing insights, check out our **Economic & Market Outlook** 

View the online version of this article here.



## **IMPORTANT INFORMATION**

U.S. investors only: Click <u>here</u> to obtain a WisdomTree ETF prospectus which contains investment objectives, risks, charges, expenses, and other information; read and consider carefully before investing.

There are risks involved with investing, including possible loss of principal. Foreign investing involves currency, political and economic risk. Funds focusing on a single country, sector and/or funds that emphasize investments in smaller companies may experience greater price volatility. Investments in emerging markets, currency, fixed income and alternative investments include additional risks. Please see prospectus for discussion of risks.

Past performance is not indicative of future results. This material contains the opinions of the author, which are subject to change, and should not to be considered or interpreted as a recommendation to participate in any particular trading strategy, or deemed to be an offer or sale of any investment product and it should not be relied on as such. There is no guarantee that any strategies discussed will work under all market conditions. This material represents an assessment of the market environment at a specific time and is not intended to be a forecast of future events or a guarantee of future results. This material should not be relied upon as research or investment advice regarding any security in particular. The user of this information assumes the entire risk of any use made of the information provided herein. Neither WisdomTree nor its affiliates, nor Foreside Fund Services, LLC, or its affiliates provide tax or legal advice. Investors seeking tax or legal advice should consult their tax or legal advisor. Unless expressly stated otherwise the opinions, interpretations or findings expressed herein do not necessarily represent the views of WisdomTree or any of its affiliates.

The MSCI information may only be used for your internal use, may not be reproduced or re-disseminated in any form and may not be used as a basis for or component of any financial instruments or products or indexes. None of the MSCI information is intended to constitute investment advice or a recommendation to make (or refrain from making) any kind of investment decision and may not be relied on as such. Historical data and analysis should not be taken as an indication or guarantee of any future performance analysis, forecast or prediction. The MSCI information is provided on an "as is" basis and the user of this information assumes the entire risk of any use made of this information. MSCI, each of its affiliates and each entity involved in compiling, computing or creating any MSCI information (collectively, the "MSCI Parties") expressly disclaims all warranties. With respect to this information, in no event shall any MSCI Party have any liability for any direct, indirect, special, incidental, punitive, consequential (including loss profits) or any other damages ( www.msci.com)

Jonathan Steinberg, Jeremy Schwartz, Rick Harper, Christopher Gannatti, Bradley Krom, Tripp Zimmerman, Michael Barrer, Anita Rausch, Kevin Flanagan, Brendan Loftus, Joseph Tenaglia, Jeff Weniger, Matt Wagner, Alejandro Saltiel, Ryan Krystopowicz, Jianing Wu, and Brian Manby are registered representatives of Foreside Fund Services, LLC.

WisdomTree Funds are distributed by Foreside Fund Services, LLC, in the U.S. only.

You cannot invest directly in an index.



## **DEFINITIONS**

**Standard deviation**: measure of how widely an investment or investment strategy's returns move relative to its average returns for an observed period. A higher value implies more "risk", in that there is more of a chance the actual return observed is farther away from the average return.

**Sharpe ratio**: Measure of risk-adjusted return. Higher values indicate greater return per unit of risk, specifically standard deviation, which is viewed as being desirable.

**S&P 500 Index**: Market capitalization-weighted benchmark of 500 stocks selected by the Standard and Poor's Index Committee designed to represent the performance of the leading industries in the United States economy.

**Russell Midcap Index**: The Russell Midcap Index measures the performance of the mid-cap value segment of the U.S. equity universe. It includes those Russell Midcap Index companies with lower price-to-book ratios and lower forecasted growth values.

**Russell 2000 Index**: Measures the performance of the small-cap segment of the U.S. equity universe. The Russell 2000 is a subset of the Russell 3000 Index representing approximately 10% of the total market capitalization of that index. It includes approximately 2000 of the smallest securities based on a combination of their market cap and current index membership.

**MSCI EAFE Index**: is a market cap-weighted index composed of companies representative of the developed market structure of developed countries in Europe, Australasia and Japan.

**BofA Merrill Lynch U.S. High Yield Index**: tracks the performance of U.S. dollar denominated below investment grade corporate debt securities issued in the U.S.

**Bloomberg U.S. Aggregate Bond Index**: Represents the investment-grade, U.S. dollar-denominated, fixed-rate taxable bond market, including Treasuries, government-related and corporate securities, as well as mortgage and asset backed securities.

**Bloomberg Commodity Index (BCOM)**: A broadly diversified commodity price index distributed by Bloomberg Indexes that tracks prices of futures contracts on physical commodities on the commodity markets.

